Mwila Joseph Mulenga¹ and Meena Bhatia² 1 Institute of Finance Management (IFM), Dar es Salaam, Tanzania 2 Birla Institute of Management Technology (BIMTECH)

Value relevance research aims in finding out whether accounting information published in financial statements provide useful and valuable information for the users of accounting information especially investors (Negakis2005, Mishary and Alanezi 2011). This study provides an extensive and comprehensive review of research undertaken on value relevance of accounting information. Interviews and previous studies undertaken in the various countries, sectors or industries were selected as sample to present the empirical findings. The purpose is to help the future researchers to have understanding on this nature of study. It provides detailed discussion of variables used by various researchers. The review considered 70 studies conducted by researchers from various countries, where stock markets are well emerged or are emerging. It helps in identifying gaps in the current literature which future research may aim to cover.

Keywords: Value relevance, accounting information, share price, stock market.

INTRODUCTION

The literature on value relevance of accounting information is vast and it investigates the relationship between share price and accounting information and also investigates whether the release of financial accounting information is related to the change in stock prices. The study on the value relevance is based on Capital market based accounting research (CMBAR) and originated from the studies carried by Beaver (1968) and Ball and Brown (1968). The majority of literature on the value relevance has comprehensively documented the relationship between accounting information and stock prices or stock returns (Francis & Schipper,1999; Lev & Zarowin,1999; Chen, Chen & Su,2001; Shamki & Rahman, 2012; Kousenidis, Ladas & Negakis,2010; Khanaga,2011; Takacs,2012, Ragab & Omran,2006; Mishary & Alanezi,2011) and few covered the reactions of the stock markets to the release of new and different financial accounting information (Bayezid & Chowdhury, 2010; Naser,2002; Javid & Faraz,2011; Dongwei 2002; Menike & Wang, 2013). Value relevance research aims in explaining the usefulness of accounting information to stock investors; it measures statistical and significant relationship between accounting information and stock prices or stock returns or both (Beisland, 2009). Value relevance research aims in finding out whether accounting information published in the financial statements provide useful



and valuable information for the users of accounting information especial investors (Negakis,2005) whilst (Amir, Harris, & Venuti,1993; Beaver & Landsman,1998; Ohlson,1999; Oyerinde,2009), define value relevance as the ability and influence of accounting of accounting numbers in capturing equity share price of listed companies.

Accounting information is defined as the written quantitative information presented in the financial statement (Oyerinde,2009) and the study on value relevance motivated by the fact that listed companies use accounting information as the means of communication with investors (Vijitha & Nimalathan,2014).The primary objective of financial statements is to provide information about the company's performance, financial position and to enable users to make better decisions particularly the investors (Tharmila & Nimalathan, 2013).

OBJECTIVE OF THE STUDY

The objective is to provide a brief academic literature and also conceptualize the publications investigated the influence of accounting variables on stock prices. To address this issue we review the literature and provide the results of different researchers and the methodology used by them. The purpose in doing so is to clarify the contribution of this area of study, its limitation and importance in the literature. The review considered 70 studies conducted by researchers from various countries, where stock markets are well emerged or are emerging. It helps in identifying gaps in the current literature which future research may aim to cover. This is descriptive study where a wide selection of papers selected from different sources. The 70 studies considered for review are primarily form Indian stock market, Nigeria stock market, Dhaka stock exchange, Colombo stock exchange, Karachi stock exchange, Shanghai stock exchange, Indonesia stock exchange,

Jakarta stock exchange, Egyptian stock exchange, Athens stock exchange, Istanbul stock exchange, Tehran stock exchange, Amman stock exchange Abu Dhabi stock market, Kuwait stock exchange and Nairobi stock exchange, Warsaw stock exchange, Chinese stock market, United Kingdom stock market, German stock market, Korea stock market, Oslo stock market, Hochiminh stock exchange, Saudi Arabia stock market, US stock market (NASDAQ,AMEX and NYSE).The studies considered for the review are from the period 1997-2014 selected from reputed journals and reference is also made to the dissertation work related to this topic.

The structure of this review paper organized as follows. Section 2 gives meaning of value relevance, section 3 give brief description about the nature of accounting information. Discussion and recommendation is covered in section 4 and section 5 is for conclusion.

MEASURING VALUE RELEVANCE

International accounting standard board (IASB 2001, p.24), defined the word relevance as the principal qualitative characteristic that financial statements should have in order to be useful in the decision making. IASB(2001 p.26) considers financial statement information to be relevant when it has the ability of influencing user's economic decision by helping them to evaluate past, present and future events and correcting their past evaluation.

Study by Amir et al.(1993) is considered as the first study to use the term "value relevance"; it defined it as the relationship between accounting figures and market value of equity. Similar definitions were used by Beisl and (2009); Barth et al.(1998); Franscie and Schipper (1999); Vijitha and Nimalathan (2014); Sharma(2014); Varun (2014).



NATURE OF ACCOUNTING INFORMATION

The primary objective of financial statements is to provide information about company's performance, financial position and to enable users to make better decisions particularly investors (Tharmila & Nimalathan, 2013; Mulenga & Bhatia, 2017). Decision of investors to invest in the company's stocks depends on financial performance of the company, and investors does not have direct way in measuring performance of the company they usually depend on the financial statements which is prepared by the company they wish to invest (Tharmila & Nimalathasan, 2013).

The following include the list of accounting variables used, its definition and empirical results as reported by different researchers.

Earnings per share

Earnings per share is presented and published in the statement of profit and loss of a company, it measures the profit allocated to each share. Profitability ratios are most popular and frequently used accounting information variable (Bhatia & Dhamija,2015). EPS was found to be significant in varied stock market across the globe; Egyptian stock exchange (Ragab & Omran, 2006); Dhaka Stock Exchange (Miah, 2012); Nigeria Stock Exchange (Thompson & Adah,2012; Olugbenga & Oyerinde, 2014); Istanbul Stock Exchange (Kargin, 2013); Indonesia Stock Exchange (Andriantomo & Yudianti, 2013); Amman stock exchange (Almumani,2014; Shamki &Rahman, 2012); Shanghai stock exchange (Wang & Luo, 2013); Sri-Lanka (Tharmila & Nimalathan, 2013, Pathirawasam, 2010, Vijitha & Namalathan, 2014). In Indian stock market as well the EPS was found to be a significant accounting variable by (Sharma,2011); Sukhija (2014); Karpagavalli & Nirmala (2014); Malhotra & Tandon (2013); Dhole (2013); Varun (2014); Khanna (2014).

Book value per share

Book value per share also known as net assets value per share is used in measuring amount of assets company has on behalf of each share. The company can have good record of past performance if the value of its book value is very high (Sharma, 2011). The impact of book value per share on share price was examined by Malhotra and Tandon (2013); Karpagavalli and Nirmala, 2014); Pathirawasam (2010); Tharmila and Nimalathan (2013); Vijitha and Namalathan (2014); Olugbenga and Overinde (2014) in Nigeria, Abdelkarim (2014), Andriantomo and Yudianti (2013); Ragab and Omran (2006); Miah (2012); Thompson and Adah (2012); Ozlen (2014); Sharma (2011). Based on their findings, book value found to have positive and significant relation with market price. Consistent with Collin, Maydew and Weiss (1997); Barth et al (1998); Francis and Schipper (1999) by using US data.

Financial leverage

Financial leverage ratios used in measuring ability of the company or business to utilize borrowed fund (Bhatia & Mehrotra,2016). Efficient use of borrowed funds by company would result to an increase in profit and more attraction to investors and would also result in increase in share price (Maliki & Ali,2013).

Empirical results of Uwalomwa, Olowe and Agu (2012) reported financial leverage ratio to have inverse relation with market share price of listed firms in Nigeria. While Malik and Ali (2013) and Floor and Chalevas (2010) show positive and significant relationship between financial leverage ratio and market share price, the results of the Oshodin and Chijoke (2014) were found to be inconsistent.



Dividend per share

Dividend defined as the source of income regularly distributed to shareholders by the firm, computed by taking annual amount of dividend paid to ordinary shareholders divided by outstanding number of equity shares. Numerous studies conducted in different stock market examined value relevance of dividend per share on share price (Oyerinde, 2009; Sharma, 2014; Nyabundi,2013; Khan & Amanullah, 2012; Olugbenga & Oyerinde, 2014). Based on their findings, dividend per share found to be positive and significant related to stock prices, consistent to Nyabundi (2013);Khan and Amanullah (2012); Sharma(2014); Varun (2012). Study by Srinavasan (2012)reported that dividend per share have negative and significant relation with share price.

Price/Earnings ratio

Price earnings ratio focused on expressing relationship between market price of the company's share and its earnings per share. The studies of Almumani (2014);Sharma and Singhania (2006); Sighania (2008); Sukhija (2014); Malhotra and Tandon (2013); Srinavasan (2012); Sharma (2011); Karpagavalli and Nirmala (2014) reported price earnings ratio to have positive and significant relation with share price. Contrary to Vijitha and Nimalathasan (2014) price earnings found to have weak negative relationship with market share price.

Return on Equity

Return on equity ratio is used in measuring amount of profit generated by company from the amount of money invested in the company by shareholders (Modi,2014; Mohanty,2012; Maliki & Ali,2013). According to Hague and Faruquee (2013) a firm reported to have high ratio of return on equity will have better investment opportunities. Compared with earnings per share and book value per share, return on equity was used in fewer studies and presumed to have positive and significant relation with market price, this evidenced in the studies of Malik and Ali (2013); Perera and Thrikawala (2010); Pathirawasam (2010); Haque and Faruque (2013); Mohanty (2012);Sharma, Kumar, and Singh (2012).Contrary to Vijitha and Nimalathasan (2014); Modi (2014) return on equity found to have positive and insignificant influence on the share price.

Return on Assets

Return on assets is used in measuring company's efficiency in utilizing assets they have for the purpose of generating company's profits. Mathematically, computed by taking a company's net earnings divided by its average of total assets(Hague & Faruquee,2013). Without considering time effect return on assets reported to have positive and significant relation with share price (Hague et al,2013). The results found to be consistent with Uwuigbe et al. (2012).

Dividend payout ratio

Dividend payout ratio usually expressed as a percentage of share of net profit calculated after taxes and preference dividend given to ordinary shareholders. The relationship has been found to be significant and positive by Uwalomwa, Oloweand Agu (2012), though there have been contrary results as well (Sukhija, 2014; Almumani2014).

The following tables show summary of selected previous work from 1997 -2014 from different countries. The study divided the table into table 1(a) and table 1 (b).Table 1 (a) cover a number of 62 studies which have a number of independent variables not more than 5 and table 1 (b) cover a number of 8 studies which have a number of independent variables more than 5.



| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
|-------|---------------------------------------|-----------|---------------------------------|---|---|---|
| 1 | Collin,Maydew and Weiss (1997) | 1953-1993 | Share price | Earnings and Book value | Ohlson (1995) valuation and Theil (1997) technique | Book value |
| 2 | Barth, Beaver and Landsman (1998). | 1974-1993 | Share price | Equity book value and Net income | Regression analysis | Equity book value |
| 3 | Jermakowicz and Gornik (1998) | 1995-1997 | Stock returns | Annual earnings, Change in earnings level. | Return model | Earnings |
| 4 | Francis and Schipper (1999) | 1952-1994 | Stock returns or Stock price | Earnings and Book value | Returns and Price model | Book value per share |
| 5 | Lev and Zarowin (1999) | 1977-1996 | Stock returns or Stock price | Earnings, Book value and Cash flow | Returns and Price model | Earnings |
| 6 | Rees (1999) | 1987-1997 | Share price | Net income, Debt and dividend per share | Simple version of Edwards, Bell and Ohlson model | Equity |
| 7 | Chen et al (2001) | 1991-1998 | Share price or Stock return | Earnings and Book value | Returns and Price model by applying pooled cross-section and time series regression | Earnings and Book value |
| 8 | Dongwei (2002) | 1997-1998 | Stock prices | Average Abnormal Returns and Cumulative Average Abnormal Returns | Event study methodology | Investors do not correctly anticipate the changes in earnings and failed to adjust to new earnings information |
| 9 | Naser (2002) | 1995-1999 | Stock prices | Average Abnormal Returns and Cumulative Average Abnormal Returns | Event methodology | Released financial statements information changing investors' behavior. |
| 10 | Bartov,Goldberg and Kim (2005) | 1998-2000 | Stock returns | Earnings | Cross-sectional model and Time series model | Earnings |
| 11 | Ragab and Omran (2006) | 1998-2002 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share. | Theoretical framework of Ohlson (1995) and Easton and Harris (1991) valuation models. | Earnings per share |
| 12 | El-Gazzar,Finn and Tang (2006) | 1970-1984 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Regression | Earnings per share. |



| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
|-------|--------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|--|--|---|
| 13 | Liu and Liu (2007) | 1999-2003 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Theoretical framework of Ohlson valuation model | Earnings per share |
| 14 | Papadaki and Siougle (2007) | 1985-1996 | Market price per share | Price earnings ratio, Book value and earnings | Simple earnings capitalization model | Price earnings ratio |
| 15 | Bae and Joeng (2007) | 1987-1998 | Share price | Earnings, Book value, Owneship structure and Business group affiliation | Regression approach based on the theoretical framework of Ohlson (1995) | Earnings and Bok value |
| 16 | Oyerinde(2009) | 2002-2008 | Share price | Book value per share, Earnings per share and Dividend per share. | Ordinary Least Squared , Random Effects Model, Fixed Effects Model and Independent - Samples t-Test. | Dividend |
| 17 | Kwon (2009) | 1981-2001 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Option style equity valuation model, Simple linear egression model, Multiple regression model and Piece linear regression model | Earnings per share. |
| 18 | Kwon (2009) | 1994-2005 | Share price | Earnings, Book value and Cash flow. | Myers (1977), Ohlson (1995) and Feltham and Ohlson (1995) valuation models | Book value and Cash flow. |
| 19 | Dung (2010). | 2003-2007 | Share price | Earnings per share, Book value per share | Ordinary Least Square, Fixed Effect Model and Random Effects Model. | Earnings per share |
| 20 | AL- Shubiri (2010) | 2005-2008 | Share price | Dividend, Net assets value per share and Earnings per share | Simple and multiple regression analysis | Net asset value per share |
| 21 | Bayezid and Ali (2010) | Jan 2008- Sept 2008 | Share price | Market dividend yield, Market price-earnings ratio | Standard event study methodology. | Dividend yield |
| 22 | Kousenidis et al. (2010) | 2003-2006 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Theoretical framework of Easton and Harris (1991) and Felt ham and Ohlson (1995) | Earnings per share |
| 23 | Pathirawasam (2010) | 2006-2009 | Share price | Earnings per share, Book value per share and Return on Equity. | Ohlson model framework (1995) | Earnings per share |



| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
|-------|---|-----------|---------------------------------|--|---|--|
| 24 | Perera and Thrikawala (2010) | 2005-2009 | Share price | Earnings per share, Return on Equity and Earnings Yield | Simple linear and multiple regression | Earnings per Share, Earning Yield and Return on Equity |
| 25 | Clarkson, Douglas, Richardson and Thompson (2011) | 2004-2005 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Ordinary Least Square, Weighted Ordinary Least Square and Product Model. | Earnings per share and Book value per share |
| 26 | Khanagha (2011) | 2001-2008 | Share price | Earnings per share, Book value per share and cash flow of the firms. | Regression variation approach and portfolio approach. | Earnings per share |
| 27 | Mishary and Alanezi (2011) | 1995-2006 | Share price or Stock returns | Earnings and Book value per share | Price model and return model | Earnings and Book value |
| 28 | Azeem and Kouser (2011) | 2002-2009 | Share prices | Book value and Earnings | Ordinary Least squared, Fixed effect model and Random effect | Book value and earnings |
| 29 | Beisland (2011) | 1994-2004 | Stock returns | Earnings and disaggregating earnings | Multiple regression analysis | Earnings |
| 30 | Agostino, Drago and Silipo (2011) | 2000-2006 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Ohlson valuation model | Earnings per share |
| 31 | Menike and Man (2013). | 5 years | Stock prices | Average Abnormal Returns and Cumulative Average Abnormal Returns | Event study, Ordinary least squared method | Average Abnormal Return and Cumulative Average Abnormal Returns are positive around the announcement day but not significant at 5% level. |
| 32 | Aleksanyan and Karim (2012) | 1996-2010 | Market value per share | Earnings per share, Book value per share, common dividends, research and development costs, and advertising expenses | Residual income and option-style valuation models, | Book value per share |
| 33 | Thompson and Adah (2012) | 2001-2009 | Share price | Book value and Earnings per share | Modified the Ohlson Residual Income Model | Book value and earnings per share |
| 34 | Shamki and Rahman (2012) | 1992-2002 | Share price | Earnings and Book value per share. | Price and return valuation models | Earnings per share |
| 35 | Miah (2012) | 2000-2010 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Multiple correlation analysis | Earnings per share |



| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
|-------|---------------------------------------|-----------|---------------------------|--|--|--|
| 36 | Abiodun (2012) | 1999-2009 | Market price per share | Earnings and Book value | Price and Logarithmic regression models | Earnings per share |
| 37 | Modugu et al (2012) | 2001-2011 | Market price per share | Dividend per share and Earnings per share | Ohlson (1995) valuation models and OLS | Earnings per share |
| 38 | Takacs(2012) | 2005-2010 | Market price per share | Earnings and Book value | Price model and Return valuation model. | Book value |
| 39 | Srinavasan (2012) | 2006-2011 | Share price | Book value per share, Price earnings ratio, Size and dividend per share | Fixed Effects model and Random Effects model | Earnings per share and Price Earnings ratio |
| 40 | Sharma et al (2012) | 1994-2009 | Share price | Return on Networth, Profit after tax, Cash flow from operation, Cash flow from investment and Market to Book value ratio | Correlation and multiple regression analysis | Return On Net worth |
| 41 | Bhatt and Sumangala (2012) | 2007-2011 | Share price | Earnings per share | Regression analysis and Correlation | Earnings per share |
| 42 | Varun (2012). | 2001-2010 | Share price | Earnings, book values, dividend, debt, capital expenditure | Ohlson (1995) price model | Dividend per share and investment expenditure |
| 43 | Devalle (2012) | 2006-2009 | Share price | Book value of equity, Net income and Other comprehensive income | Price regression model | Comprehensive income |
| 44 | Karğın (2013) | 1998-2011 | Share price | Book value and Earnings per share | Theoretical framework of Ohlson (1995) valuation models. | Earnings per share |
| 45 | Halolen, Jelena and Rickard (2013) | 2007-2010 | Market price per share | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Theoretical framework of Ohlson valuation model | Book value per share |
| 46 | Malik and Ali(2013) | 2001-2009 | Share price | Financial leverage, Current ratio, Net profit margin, Return on equity and Assets turnover. | The pooled ordinary least squares regression (OLS) and panel data fixed effects regression | Financial leverage and Assets turnover |
| 47 | Andriantomo and Yudianti (2013) | 2000-2009 | Share price | Earnings per share and NBVPS | Ohlson (1995) valuation model | Book value |
| 48 | Tharmila and Nimalathasan (2013) | 2009-2013 | Share price | Earnings per share and NBVPS | Correlation and regression techniques | Earnings per share and Net book value |



| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
|-------|------------------------------------|-----------|---------------------------|---|--|---|
| 49 | Nyabundi(2013) | 2005-2010 | Share price | Dividend, earnings and book values | Simple linear regression models and multiple regression | Dividend |
| 50 | Kairuki and Oyugi (2013) | 1998-2011 | Share price | Returns on equity, earnings per share and book values of equity | Residual income valuation method. | Book value of equity and Return on equity |
| 51 | Buguit et al (2013) | 2006-2011 | Share price | Debt, equity and gearing ratio | Multiple regression method | Gearing and debt ratio. |
| 52 | Pathirawasam (2013) | 2005-2009 | Market price per share | Earnings and Book value | Ohlson (1995) model framework | Earnings and Book value |
| 53 | Menike and Man (2013) | 2008-2012 | Stock price | Abnormal returns and cumulative abnormal returns | Event study methodology | Abnormal return and cumulative abnormal return found to be positive but insignificant around the release of annual financial statements. |
| 54 | Vijitha and Nimalathasan (2014) | 2007-2011 | Market value per share | EPS), (NAVPS), and Return On Equity (ROE) and Price Earnings Ratio | Correlation and Regression analysis | Book value per share,P/E ratio and Earnings per share |
| 55 | Olugbenga and Oyerinde (2014). | 1992-2009 | Share price | Earnings, Book Value Per Share, Dividend per share and Cash flow per share | Ordinary Least Square (OLS) regression method | Earnings per share |
| 56 | Shehzad and Ismail 2014) | 2008-2012 | Share price | Earnings per share and Book value per share | Pooled regression technique | Earnings per share |
| 57 | Oshodin and Chijoke(2014) | 2007-2011 | Share price | Earnings per share, Book value of equity, and Leverage | Multiple regressions analysis and OLS | Earnings per share |
| 58 | Almumani (2014) | 2005-2011 | Share price | Earnings per share, Dividend per share, Book value per share, Price Earnings ratio and Size | Correlation and a linear multiple regression models | Earnings per share, Book value per share and Price earnings ratio. |
| 59 | Sharma (2014) | 2001-2013 | Share price | Dividends, book value and earnings | Correlation Analysis | Dividend and Earnings per share |
| 60 | Khanna (2014) | 2006-2010 | Share price | Book value per share and Earnings per share | Correlation and Regression analysis | Book value per share and Earnings per share. |



| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
|-------|----------------------------------|-----------|---------------------------|---|--|--|
| 61 | Oyerinde and Olugbenga (2014) | 1990-2009 | Share price | Earnings, Book Value Per Share, Dividend per share and Cash flow per share | General least squared regression method | Earnings, Book Value Per Share, Dividend per share and Cash flow per share |
| 62 | Varun (2014) | 2006-2011 | Market value of equity | Abnormal earnings, book value per share and Cash flow from operations | Theoretical framework of Ohlson valuation model | Abnormal earnings and book value per share |

Note: This table shows the summary of studies with independent variable not more than 5.

| | Table | 1 (b), Summa | ary of studies wit | th independent variab | le more than 5. | |
|-------|------------------------------------|--------------|---------------------------|--|---|---|
| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
| 1 | Ozlen (2010) | 2000-2012 | Share price | Total asset turnover ratio, Debt ratio, Current ratio, Price to Earnings ratio, Net profit margin, and Book value. | Non-Linear and Multivariate | Book value |
| 2 | Chalmers, Navissi and Qu (2010) | 1997-2004 | Share price | Earnings per share, Book value of equity, Operating cash flow per share, Debt to equity and Share return | Return regression model | Book value per share |
| 3 | Sharma (2011). | 1993-2009 | Market price per share | Book value per share, Dividend per share, Earnings per share, Price earnings ratio, Dividend Yield, Dividend payout ratio, Size in terms of sale and net worth for the period. | Correlation and a linear multiple regression models | Dividend |
| 4 | Mohanty (2012) | 2003-2007 | Share price | RONW, FA to total assets ratio, CFO to total assets ratio, Investment to total Assets ratio, Current ratio and Debt equity ratio | Panel data regression model | Cash flow from operations to total assets, Debt equity ratio, Investments to total assets and Return on net worth. |



| S/No. | Author(s) | Year | Dependent variable | Independent variables | Method of analysis used in the study | Most significant accounting information |
|-------|-----------------------------|-----------|--|---|--|--|
| 5 | Wang et al (2013) | 2011 | Share price | Earnings per share, Price-Earnings ratio, Income from main operation ratio, Return on Equity, Receivable turnover ratio, Inventory turnover ratio, liquidity ratio and current ratio | Correlation and Regression analysis | Earnings per share and Return on equity. |
| 6 | Haque and Faruque (2013) | 2005-2011 | Share price | Earnings per share, Dividend per share, Return on equity, Return on Asset, and the ratio (Fixed Asset/Total Asset), Net Assets value | Multiple regression analysis | Net Assets Value |
| 7 | Sukhija (2014) | 2000-2013 | Share price | Book Value, Dividend per Share, Earnings per share, Dividend payout ratio and Growth, ROCE, Price Earnings ratio. | Fixed Effects model and Random Effects model | Earnings per share |
| 8 | Modi (2014) | 2004-2013 | Market price and Price to Book value ratio and Market price | Price Earnings ratio, Net income, Earnings Yield, Return on Equity, Cash flow from operating, Cash flow from financing and Net worth | Regression and Correlation analysis | Price Earnings ratio and Net income |

Note: This table shows the summary of studies with independent variable more than 5.

METHODOLOGIES USED IN VALUE RELEVANCE STUDIES

Correlation and multiple regression analysis are used as the method of analysis to examine value relevance of accounting information (Sharma et al, 2012; Bhatt & Sumangala, 2012; Tharmila & Nimalathasan, 2013; Vijitha & Nimalathasan, 2014; Modi 2014; Oshodin & Chijoke, 2014). Other method of analysis mostly used were simple and multiple regression (Nyabundi, 2013; Haque & Faruque, 2013; Buguit et al, 2013; Oshodin & Chijoke, 2014), pooled ordinary least square and fixed regression (Malik &Ali 2013; Olugbenga & Oyerinde, 2014), Price Logarithmic regression (Abioud, 2012), Cross sectional linear regression (Bartov et al, 2005), Ordinary least squared, fixed effects model and random effects model (Dung 2010; Oyerinde 2009).

DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

The objective of value relevance is to establish relationship between accounting numbers and stock prices/stock returns (Beisland, 2009; Oyerinde, 2009; Amir et al, 1993; Barth et al, 2009; Ohlson, 1999; Barth



et al,1998). In testing value relevance of accounting numbers, book value and earnings found to be the most significant and leading variables in value relevance literature as can be interpreted from table 1a and b. Other accounting variables like financial leverage, dividend per share, price earnings ratio, return on equity, return on assets and dividend payout ratio have been used in addition to book value and earnings in order to determine its significance influence on the market share prices. This review focus on the value relevance of accounting information presented in the income statements and balance sheets and the overall empirical findings suggested that balance sheet items (book value) and income statement (earnings, dividend per share) are value relevant.

Different methodologies used by various researchers in examine value relevance of accounting information like price and returns valuation models. The results of both price and returns models showed that earnings and book value jointly and individually have positive and significance influence on the market share prices and stock returns. Future review on value relevance may focus on value relevance studies that used theoretical framework of Ohlson (1995) and Easton and Harris (1991) and link it with the adoption of international accounting standards. In addition, researchers may also focus on studies related to the announcements made by companies and its reactions on stock prices.

CONCLUSION AND CONTRIBUTION OF THE STUDY

One of the main goals of financial reporting is to assist users of accounting information particularly stock investors in estimating value of the company. Research on value relevance studies investigates whether this goal has been achieved or not. The study identifies that earnings per share and book value per share are the most significant and leading variables in value relevance literature. Other accounting variables like financial leverage, dividend per share, price earnings ratio, return on equity, return on assets and dividend payout ratio have been used in addition to book value and earnings in order to determine its significance influence on stock prices. The results on value relevance studies found to be contradictory from one market to another may be because of accounting regulations differences, behavior of the market, methodology used, length of time period considered and number of companies selected as sample. There are many studies across countries and sectors which study the value relevance of accounting information, future research may focus on qualitative information that impact the stock prices movement. This study contribute to the literature by documenting the results of previous researchers and this will help new and future researchers who wish to familiarize with this line of empirical accounting research. The significance of this review originates from the importance of accounting information to investors and other user of financial statements in making informed investment decisions and other economic decisions.

REFERENCES

Abiodun. (2012).Significance of accounting information on corporate values of firms in Nigeria. Research Journal in Organizational Psychology & Educational Studies, 1(2), 105-113.

Agostino, M., Drago, D., & Silipo, D.(2011). The value relevance of IFRS in the European banking. Rev Quant Finan Acc, 36, 437–457

Aleksanyan & Karim, K. (2012).Searching for value relevance of book value and earnings: A case of premium versus discount firms. Rev Quant Finance Accounting.

Almumani, M.A. (2014). Determinants of equity share prices of the listed banks in Amman stock exchange: Quantitative approach: International Journal of Business and Social Science, 5(1).

Amir, E., Harris, T.S., & Venuti, E.K. (1993). A comparison of the value relevance of U.S. versus non-U.S. GAAP accounting measures using forms 20-F reconciliations, Journal of Accounting Research, 31(3), 230264.

Andriantomo & Yudianti, F. (2013). The value relevance of accounting information at Indonesia stock exchange: International Conference on Business, Economics, and Accounting 20–23 March 2013, Bangkok–Thailand.

AL-Shubiri (2010). Analysis of the relationship between economic



forces and abnormal stock return: Empirical evidence. Polish Journal of Management Studies, 8.

Azeem, M., &Kouser, R. (2011).International accounting standards and value relevance of book value and earnings: Panel study from Pakistan. International Journal of Contemporary Business Studies, 2(9).

Bae, K., & Joeng, S. (2007). The value relevance of earnings and book value, ownership structure, and business group affiliation: Evidence from Korean business groups. Journal of Business Finance & Accounting, 34(5), 740-766.

Ball, R., & Brown, P. (1968). An Empirical Evaluation of Accounting Income Numbers, Journal of Accounting Research, 6(2), 159-178.

Barth, M., Beaver, W., & Landsman, W. (1998). Relative valuation roles of equity book value and net income as a function of financial health. Journal Accounting and Economics, 1-34.

Bartov, E., Goldberg, S.R., &Kim, M. (2005).Comparative value relevance among German, U.S., and international accounting standards: A German Stock Market Perspective. Journal of Accounting, Auditing & Finance, 20(2), 95-119.

Beisland, L.A. (2009). A review of the value relevance literature. The Open Business Journal, 2, 7-27.

Beisland (2011). The effects of earnings variables on stock returns among Public companies in Norway: A multiple regression analysis. International Journal of Management, (28)3.

Bayezid & Chowdhury. (2010). Effect of dividend on stock price in emerging stock market: A study on the listed private commercial banks in DSE. International Journal of Economics and Finance, (2)4

Beaver, W. (1968). The information content of annual earnings announcements. Journal of Accounting Research, *6*, 67-92.

Bhatia, M., & Dhamija, S. (2015). Voluntary disclosure of financial ratios in India. South Asian Journal of Management, 22(1), 29-51.

Bhatia, M., & Mehrotra.V (2016). Determinants of Intellectual Capital Disclosure: Evidence from Indian banking Sector. South Asian Journal of Management, Volume 23(1), 89-111

Bhatt & Sumangala, JK. (2012).Impact of earnings per share on market value of an equity share: An empirical study in Indian capital market. Journal of Finance, Accounting and Management, 3(2), 1-14.

Buguit, Soy, Koskei & Kibet. (2013). The effect of capital structure on share price on listed firms in Kenya. A Case of energy listed firms. European Journal of Business and Management, (5), 9.

Chen, C, Chen, S., & Su, X. (2001). Is accounting information value relevant in the emerging Chinese stock market? Journal of International Accounting Auditing & Taxation, 10(1), 1-22.

Clarkson, P., Hanna, J.D., Richardson, G.D., &Thompson, R. (2011). The impact of IFRS adoption on the value relevance of book value and earnings. Journal of Contemporary Accounting and Economics, 7(1), 1-17.

Collins, D., Maydew, E. & Weiss, I. S. (1997). Changes in the value

relevance of earnings and book values over the past forty years. Journal of Accounting and Economics, 24(1), 39-67.

Chalmers, K.,Clinch,G.,&Godfrey,J.M.(2008).Adoption of International financial reporting standards: Impact on the value relevance of intangible assets. Australian Accounting Review, 18,237-247.

Devalle, A. (2012).Value relevance of accounting data and financial crisis in Europe: An empirical analysis. International Journal of Accounting and Financial Reporting, 2(2)

Dongwei, Su(2002). Stock price reaction to earnings announcement: Evidence from Chinese Market. Review of Financial Economics, North Holland

Dung, N.V. (2010).Value-relevance of financial statement information: A flexible application of modern theories to the Vietnamese stock market. Paper presented at the Development and Policies Research Center, Vietnam.

Easton, P.E., & Harris (1991). Earnings as an explanatory variable for returns: Journal of Accounting Research, 29(1), 19-36.

El-Gazzar,S.M.,Finn,P.,& Tang, C. (2006). The relative importance of earnings and book value in regulated and deregulated markets: the case of the airline industry. Faculty Working Papers. Paper 58.http://digitalcommons.pace.edu/lubinfaculty_workingpape rs/58.

Francis, J., & Schipper, K. (1999). Have financial statements lost their relevance? Journal of Accounting Research, 37(2), 319-352.

Haque & Faruquee. (2013).Impact of fundamental factors on stock price: A case based approach on pharmaceutical companies listed with Dhaka stock exchange. International Journal of Business and Management Invention, 2(9), 34-41.

IASB (2001).International accounting standard boards, Framework for the preparation and presentation of financial statement, IASB, London, United Kingdom.

Javid I. & Faraz, A.F. (2011) .The stock price reaction to earnings announcement: The case of an Emerging Market. (Online) Department of Statistics, Karachi University, Pakistan, http://mpra.ub.unimuenchen.de/30865.

Jermakowicz, E.,& Gornik-Tomaszewski, S. (1998).Information content of earnings in the emerging capital market. Evidence from Warsaw stock exchange. Multinational Finance Journal, 2(4), 245.

Kairuki & Oyugi (2013).Testing the residual income valuation model in a Nascent stock market: The case of Nairobi securities exchange. International Journal of Business and Social Science, 4(10).

Khanagha (2011).Value relevance of accounting Information in the United Arab Emirates: International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues, 1(2), 33-45.

Khanna, M. (2014).Value relevance of accounting information: An empirical study of selected Indian firms. International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications, 4(10).

Khan & Amanullah. (2012).Determinants of share prices at

Amity Business Review Vol. 19, No. 1, January - June, 2018



Karachi stock exchange. International Journal of Business and Management Studies, 4(1).

Karğın, S. (2013). The impact of IFRS on the value relevance of accounting Information: Evidence from Turkish Firms: International Journal of Economics and Finance, 5(4).

Karpagavalli &Nirmala (2013).Determination of market price of select banking companies by using year wise Y-X correlation analysis:Gra-Global Research Analysis, 3.

Kousenidis, D., Ladas, A., & Negakis, C. (2010). Value relevance of accounting Information in the pre- and post-IFRS accounting periods. European Research Studies, VIII (1)

Kwon, G.J. (2009). The Value relevance of book values, earnings and cash flows: Evidence from Korea. International Journal of Business and Management, 4(10).

Kwon, G.J. (2009). The value relevance of earnings and book value using an option-style equity valuation model: Evidence from Korea. International Journal of Business and Management, 4(12).

Lev, B., & Zarowin, P. (1999).The boundaries of financial reporting and how to extend them. Journal of Accounting Research, 37(2), 353-385.

Liu, J., & Liu, C. (2007). Value relevance of accounting information in different stock market segments: The case of Chinese A-B-and H-shares. Journal of International Accounting Research, 6(2).

Malhotra & Tandon (2013).Determinants of stock prices: Empirical evidence from NSE 100 companies. International Journal of Research in Management & Technology, 3.

Malik, M.F.,&Ali, B. (2013).Value relevance of accounting information: Evidence from fuel and energy sector of Pakistan: Journal of Basic Applied Science Research, 3(7), 884-891.

Miah, M.S. (2012). Value relevance of accounting information and stock market vulnerability - a study on listed companies in Dhaka stock exchange. International Journal of Research in Commerce & Management, 3(4).

Menike M.G.P.D. & Wang Man. (2013) .Stock market reactions to the release of annual financial statements: Case of the banking industry in Sri Lanka, 5(31). European Journal of Business and Management, 5(31)

Mishary, A., & Alanezi, F. (2011).Usefulness of earnings and book value for equity valuation to Kuwait stock exchange participants. International Business and Economic Research Journal, 10(1), 3.

Modi, S. (2014). A study on value relevance of accounting information in Indian stock market: the case of auto sector. The International Journal of Business & Management

Mohanty, P.K. (2012).Relevance of accounting numbers-Empirical analysis of the IT and steel sector. Journal of Arts, Humanities and Management, 1.

Modugu, Okafor & Ohonba (2012).Price level changes and financial accounting measurement: Empirical evidences from Nigeria. Journal of Management and Corporate Governance, 4.

Mulenga, M., & Bhatia, M. (2017). The review of literature on the role of earnings, cash flows and accruals in predicting future cash flow, Accounting and Finance Research, 6(2)

Nasar, K. (2002).Share price reactions to the release of financial statements in emerging stock Markets: The case of Saudia Arabia. International Financial system and Stock Volatility, 13.

Negakis, J.C. (2005). Accounting and capital market research. Areview. Managerial Finance, 31(2), 1.

Nyabundi, M. (2013).Value relevance of financial statements information: Evidence from listed firms in Kenya. Advances in Management & Applied Economics, 3(1), 115-134

Olugbenga, A., & Oyerinde, A. (2014). The relationship between financial accounting information and market values of quoted firms in Nigeria: Global Journal of Contemporary Research in Accounting, Auditing and Business Ethics (GJCRA), 1.

Olugbenga, A., & Oyerinde, A. (2014). Value relevance of financial accounting information of quoted companies in Nigeria: A trend analysis: Research Journal of Finance and Accounting, 5(8).

Oshodin & Chijoke. (2014). The comparative study of value relevance of financial information in the Nigeria banking and petroleum sectors. Journal of Business Studies Quarterly, 6(1).

Ohlson, J.A. (1995). Earnings, book values and dividends in security valuation. Contemporary Accounting Research, 11(1), 661-688.

Oyerinde, D.T. (2009).Value relevance of accounting information in emerging stock market in Nigeria. Proceeding of the 10th annual international conference. International academy of African business and development (IAABD), Uganda.

Ozlen, S. (2014). The effect of company fundamentals on stock values. European Researcher, (71), 3-2.

Pathirawasam, C. (2010).Value relevance of accounting information: Evidence from Sri-Lanka.International Journal of research in commerce & management, 1(8)

Papadaki & Siougle. (2007). Value relevance of price, earnings and book values in the Athens Stock Exchange. Managerial Finance, (33)5,309-320.

Perera, A.A., & Thrikawala, S.S.(2010). An empirical study of the relevance of accounting information on investor's decisions, proceedings of international research conference on business & information".

Ragab, A., & Omran. (2006). Accounting information, value relevance, and investors' behavior in the Egyptian equity market. Review of Accounting and Finance, 5(3), 279-297. DOI 10.1108/14757700610686444.

Rees, W. (1997). The impact of dividends, debt and investment on valuation models, Journal of Business, Finance and Accounting, 24, 1111-1140.

Shamki, D., & Rahman, A.A. (2012). Value relevance of earnings and book Value: evidence from Jordan. International Journal of Business and Management, 7 (3). Doi: 10.5539.



Sharma, S. (2011).Determinants of equity share prices in India. Journal of Arts, Science & Commerce.

Sharma, M. (2014).Value relevance of accounting information: A comparative study of public and private sector companies in India. Asia Pacific Journal of Research, I (XII),

Sharma, A, Kumar, S, & Singh, R. (2012).Value relevance of financial reporting and its impact on stock Prices: Evidence from India.South Asian Journal of Management, 19(2), 60-77.

Shehzad, K., & Ismail, A. (2014).Value relevance of accounting information and its impact on stock prices: Case study of listed banks at Karachi stock exchange. Journal of Economic Info, 3(1), 40-48.

Srinivasan, P. (2012).Determinants of equity share prices in India: A panel data approach": The Romanian Economic Journal, (XV), and 46,205-228.

Sukhija, S. (2014). A Study regarding analyzing recessionary impact on fundamental determinants of stock prices in India share market: European Journal of Business and Management, 6(4).

Takacs (2012).The value relevance of earnings in a transition economy: Evidence from Romanian stock market. Annales Universitatis Apulensis Series Oeconomica, 14(1),

Tharmila, K., & Nimalathasan, B.(2013). The Value relevance of accounting information and its impact on market vulnerability: A Study of listed manufacturing companies in Sri Lanka.Research Journal of Finance and Accounting,4(18).

Thompson, S., & Adah. (2012).Stock market crisis and value relevance of accounting information: Impact on quoted cement manufacturing firms in Nigeria. International Journal of Research in Commerce & Management, 3(10).

Varun, D. (2014).Earnings persistence and stock prices: Empirical evidence from an emerging market. Journal of Financial Reporting and Accounting, 12 (2).

Varun, D. (2012).Role of fundamental variables in explaining stock prices: Indian FMCG sector evidence. Journal of Arts, Science & Commerce.

Vijitha P., & Nimalathasan B, (2014).Value relevance of accounting information and share price: A study of listed manufacturing companies in Sri Lanka: Merit Research Journal of Business and Management, 2(1), 001-006.

BRIEF PROFILE OF THE AUTHORS

Mwila J. Mulenga is Assistant Lecturer in Accounting and Auditing at the Institute of Finance Management (IFM), Dares Salaam, Tanzania. She is a PhD Scholar at Birla Institute of Management Technology (BIMTECH), Greater Noida, India. She did Msc. Finance from Strathclyde University, (United Kingdom) and Advanced Diploma in Accountancy from the Institute of Finance Management (IFM), Dar es Salaam Tanzania. She has about three years of corporate experience and ten years of teaching experience. Her research papers have been published in reputable journals like Accounting and Finance Research (AFR), Canada, International Journal of Indian Culture and Business Management (IJICBM), India, International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management (IJECM), United Kingdom, International Journal of Accounting and Financial Reporting (IJAFR), United States. Her research interest are in the area of accounting information, capital market and corporate governance.

Meena Bhatia, PhD., is Associate professor (Finance and Accounting) with Birla Institute of Management Technology (BIMTECH). She has a PhD in Finance, besides being FCMA, CFA, MBA and B.Com (Hons) from Delhi University. Her research interest and contribution include topics covering financial markets, disclosures and financial reporting. She has presented her research work at internationally acclaimed institutions such as, Harvard University (Boston USA), University of London, IIM (Ahmadabad), IIT (Delhi), IIT (Kharagpur) IIM (Lucknow), IMI (Delhi), etc. Dr Bhatia has publications in national and international journals of repute. She is also providing research guidance to PhD scholars. She is on the Editorial Board and on reviewers' panel of South Asian Journal of Business and Management Cases published by Sage Publications and on the reviewers' panel of many Emerald and Inderscience Journals.

